



# **EVALUATION IN PLANNING**

**CITTA 1<sup>ST</sup> ANNUAL CONFERENCE ON PLANNING RESEARCH**

**EDITED BY PAULO PINHO AND VITOR OLIVEIRA**

**PROCEEDINGS OF CITTA 1ST ANNUAL  
CONFERENCE ON PLANNING RESEARCH  
EVALUATION IN PLANNING**

Coordination Paulo Pinho, Edition and Design Vítor Oliveira

Colecção *Planeamento*  
Série *Investigação*  
Direcção *Paulo Pinho*  
Projecto gráfico *Vítor Oliveira*  
Impressão e acabamentos -----(?)  
1.ª edição, 2009  
Depósito legal n.º -----(?)  
ISBN -----(?)  
© Paulo Pinho, Vítor Oliveira  
© Faculdade de Engenharia da Universidade do Porto  
Rua Dr. Roberto Frias, 4200-465 Porto

Todos os direitos reservados. Nenhuma  
parte deste livro pode ser reproduzida  
por processo mecânico, electrónico ou  
outro sem autorização escrita do editor.

# Contents

Preface <i>Paulo Pinho</i>	5
Opening address <i>João Ferrão</i>	7
<b>Part 1. Evaluation in Planning</b>	9
Introduction to Evaluation in Planning <i>Patsy Healey</i>	11
Evaluation for integration of urban policies: a methodological proposal <i>Isabel Breda-Vázquez, Paulo Conceição, Pedro Mória</i>	13
Evaluation in urban planning: from theory to practice <i>Vitor Oliveira, Paulo Pinho</i>	31
<b>Part 2. Transport Planning</b>	51
Introduction to Transport Planning <i>Kenneth Button</i>	53
Analyzing the effects of transport initiatives on the quality of urban environment: empirical results from Porto Metropolitan Area <i>Miguel Pimentel, Sandra Melo, Álvaro Costa</i>	55
A multi-objective approach to road network planning <i>António Antunes, Bruno Santos</i>	65
Innovation in transport modes and services in urban areas and their potential to fight congestion <i>José Manuel Viegas, João Abreu, Rafaela Arriaga</i>	79
<b>Part 3. Urban Planning Policies</b>	91
Introduction to Urban Planning Policies <i>Klaus Kunzmann</i>	93

Planning tensions towards a new urban paradigm: social justice and the regeneration of Portuguese cities <i>Ricardo Cardoso, Isabel Breda-Vázquez</i>	97
Evaluation of ICT in territorial planning: the perception of planners <i>Miguel Branco-Teixeira, Isabel Breda-Vázquez</i>	107
Extensive urbanization – a new scale for planning <i>Álvaro Domingues</i>	129
<b>Part 4. Environmental Planning</b>	153
Introduction to Environmental Planning <i>Jean-Paul Carrière</i>	155
The impact of closed condominiums in the urban form and structure of metropolitan areas <i>Sara Santos, Paulo Pinho, Mafalda Ferreira</i>	159
Structural accessibility for urban policy: the case of Greater Oporto <i>Cecília Silva, Paulo Pinho</i>	175
Planning and management of urban renovation projects: the Expo area and the pursuit of sustainability <i>Fernando Nunes da Silva, Francisco Serdoura, Renata Lajas</i>	195
<b>Appendix 1. Abstracts of papers presented at the conference not included in this book</b>	223

## Preface

**Paulo Pinho**

Director of CITTA

This book contains a fair selection of the papers presented at the 1<sup>st</sup> CITTA's annual conference. In line with our initial intentions and, indeed, with the programme of the conference, the four parts of this book present a mixed and balanced picture of a wide and diverse range of research contributions coming both from our centre and from other Portuguese research centres with a particular interest in planning.

The title - *Planning Evaluation* - reflects the general theme of the conference. As a research topic, the evaluation of planning activities already has a long history and yet, it is still a rather difficult and controversial issue to address. The first contributions date back to the 1960s. At that time, a number of evaluation methodologies appeared in the planning literature as refinements of the classical Cost Benefit Analysis. Their general conceptual framework was very much in accordance with the then dominant rational comprehensive planning model. However, those early days left very few records of practical applications, at least documented in the international planning literature.

With the subsequent evolution of planning theories, from the mid 1980s through to the turn of the century, and the emergence and steady dissemination of the collaborative planning paradigm, new and more complex methodologies have been proposed but, again, very few contributions can be traced in the planning literature of systematic applications in local planning departments or in independent planning research units.

Everyone seems to agree that evaluation is an essential component of the planning process and an indispensable instrument to (re)design responsive planning policies. But, actually, very few invest their time and resources in systematic planning evaluation exercises geared towards the preparation and implementation of a particular land use plan or planning policy document, or towards the assessment of the role and overall performance of a particular regional or local planning department. In this respect, the reader can find in the first part of this book a number of contributions coming from different CITTA's research units and also from elsewhere, trying to bridge, albeit modestly, this most noticeable gap between theory and practice. The other three parts of the book group several contributions under the general themes of CITTA's research units, namely *Planning and Environmental Assessment*, *Urban policies and Housing* and *Transport Planning and Logistics*. Each part starts with a brief introduction written by the chair of the respective session. To all involved, chairs and papers' authors, our most sincere thanks.

Our Secretary of State for Planning and the Cities, Prof. João Ferrão, gave us the honour to open the conference. His opening address follows this introduction. It is our firm believe that planning research has a fundamental role to play in planning practice, in Portugal and elsewhere, either helping to improve the general quality standards of planning practices or facilitating knowledge and more rigorous, comprehensive and innovative methods and policy instruments.



## Opening address

**João Ferrão**

Secretary of State for Spatial Planning and Towns

A realização desta Conferência não pode ser mais oportuna.

De facto, vivemos actualmente um contexto decisivo de dupla transição, ao nível nacional e comunitário, cujos efeitos reciprocamente benéficos interessa potenciar e reforçar.

Ao nível interno, creio poder afirmar que está hoje em vias de consolidação a transição do paradigma moderno, racionalista e normativo de ordenamento do território típico do período do pós-guerra, mas com impacte tardio em Portugal, para uma visão mais estratégica, participada e humanista.

Ao nível externo, a consagração no Tratado reformador de Lisboa da coesão territorial como terceira componente da Política de Coesão comunitária vem permitir que o ordenamento do território deixe de ser, como até aqui, uma competência exclusiva dos estados-membros para se afirmar no futuro como uma competência partilhada entre a União Europeia e os estados-membros.

Felizmente, dispomos hoje dos instrumentos essenciais para garantir a coerência e, espero, a irreversibilidade dessas duas transições.

Em termos de documentos enquadradores, o PNPOT – Programa Nacional da Política de Ordenamento do Território, ao nível nacional, e a Agenda Territorial e a Carta de Leipzig para o desenvolvimento sustentável das cidades, ao nível comunitário, garantem a definição de linhas de rumo estratégicas baseadas em princípios orientadores claros e mobilizadores.

Em termos de concretização, os PROT – Planos Regionais de Ordenamento do Território, que deverão cobrir integralmente o território de Portugal continental a partir de 2009, e, ao nível comunitário, o Plano de Acção da Agenda Territorial, aprovado durante a presidência portuguesa, e o Livro Verde sobre Coesão Territorial, que a Comissão Europeia irá colocar em debate público em Setembro de 2008, permitirão definir programas orientados para a acção.

Finalmente, e no que se refere à dimensão de acompanhamento e avaliação das políticas de ordenamento do território, o início das actividades do Observatório do Ordenamento do Território e do Urbanismo, que funciona junto da DGOTDU, e o reforço do papel do ESPON no quadro das competências comunitárias permitirão identificar, em tempo útil, aspectos que importa corrigir ou reforçar de modo a que os objectivos prosseguidos pelas políticas de ordenamento do território e os resultados e efeitos esperados se possam concretizar.

Neste contexto particularmente promissor, mas em que nada está ainda garantido, a realização desta Conferência é não só oportuna como útil. Na realidade, são encontros deste tipo que contribuem para uma maior robustez técnico-científica dos debates sobre ordenamento do território e para uma maior socialização do conhecimento e das competências que esses debates exigem entre os profissionais com actividade neste domínio. E essa é a boa via – a única via – para que o domínio do ordenamento do território abandone definitivamente o estatuto algo dormente, ao nível nacional, e quase furtivo, ao nível comunitário, que hoje o caracteriza.



## Opening address<sup>1</sup>

**João Ferrão**

Secretary of State for Spatial Planning and Towns

The timing of this conference could not be more appropriate.

Indeed, we are living in a critical context of a twofold transition, both at national and European levels, and whose reciprocal beneficial effects must be explored and strengthened.

At the national level, I believe we are currently consolidating the transition from the modern, rational and normative paradigm of territorial planning, characteristic of the post-war period but with a late impact on Portugal, to a more strategic, participated and humanistic vision.

At the European level, the statement on territorial cohesion as the third component of the European cohesion policies, in the Lisbon Treaty, enables territorial planning to be more than an exclusive competence of the different member states (as until now) to become, in the near future, a competence shared by the European Union and the member states.

Fortunately, we have the needed instruments to ensure the coherence and, I hope, the irreversibility of these two transition processes.

As far as the major framework documents are concerned, the *Programa Nacional da Política de Ordenamento do Território* / PNPOT (National Programme for Territorial Planning Policy) at the national level, and the Territorial Agenda and the Leipzig Charter for the sustainable development of cities, at the European level, ensure the definition of strategic lines based on clear guidelines and mobilizing principles.

As far as implementation is concerned, two different contributions should enable the definition of action-oriented programmes. The first corresponds to the *Planos Regionais de Ordenamento do Território* / PROT (Regional Plans) that should cover the mainland of Portugal in 2009. The second, at the European level, corresponds to the Territorial Agenda approved during the Portuguese Presidency, and to the Green Paper on Territorial Cohesion, that the European Commission will shortly submit to public debate in September of 2008.

Finally, in terms of monitoring and evaluation of territorial planning policies, the launching of the Observatory on Planning and Urbanism (working alongside with the *Direcção-Geral do Ordenamento do Território e Desenvolvimento Urbano* / DGOTDU) and the reinforcement of the role of ESPON, within the European framework of competencies, should contribute to fulfill the objectives of territorial planning policies, and to achieve the foreseen results and effects.

In this context, rather promising but still not yet guaranteed, this Conference is both timely and useful. Indeed, meetings such as these contribute to a more robust technical and scientific debate on territorial planning and to a wider dissemination of knowledge and skills among planning professionals. This is a good way – perhaps the only way – to move territorial planning beyond its current state, somehow inactive at the national level, and almost secretive at the European level.

---

<sup>1</sup> Translation from Portuguese by the editors.

## **Part 1. Evaluation in Planning**